

Report of the joint evaluation of the Indonesian ECB consortium's responses to the West Java and West Sumatra earthquakes

April 2010

Independent Evaluation by Pauline Wilson with the support of Budi Setiawan, Maria Josephine Wijastuti, LeAnn Hager and Yacobus Runtuwene.

Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Executive Summary.....	3
Abbreviations	8
1. Introduction.....	11
2. The joint evaluation team and process	11
3. The structure of the report	13
4. A brief history of ECB in Indonesia.....	14
5. The West Java earthquake and the response by ECB member agencies	16
6. The West Sumatra earthquake	17
6.1 The context	17
6.2 The response by ECB member agencies	18
6.3 Coverage	19
6.4 Programs under consortia grants	20
The appropriateness of the activities carried out.....	21
The quality of the response or how agencies involved and informed beneficiaries about their programs	21
Effectiveness in terms of needs assessment and response speed and the use of standards.....	23
The immediate intended and unintended impacts of the programs	24
Improvements and recommendations from village level.....	25
6.5 The similarities and differences between ECB agency programs.....	26
7. External views of the Indonesian ECB consortium	26
7.1 A summary of external views	28
8. The effectiveness of ECB's internal coordination.....	28
8.1 The successes and benefits of greater collaboration.....	29
8.2 The challenges of collaborating more during a response	29
Funding and resource use	29
New emergency staff and communications	30
Rules of engagement	30
8.3 Major learnings	31
9. Conclusions on the consortium's joint actions during the West Sumatra response.....	31
10. Recommendations by ECB Indonesia member agencies	33
Annexes	35

Annex 1: Terms of reference	35
Annex 2: Joint evaluation schedule.....	41
Annex 3: Number of participants at village level.....	42
Annex 4: Joint evaluation participants.....	43
Annex 5: CARE’s Emergency Response to the West Sumatera Earthquake.....	45
Annex 6: Catholic Relief Services Emergency Response to the West Sumatera Earthquake	48
Annex 7: Mercy Corps Emergency Response to the West Sumatera Earthquake.....	50
Annex 8: Save The Children’s Emergency Response to the West Sumatera Earthquake	53
Annex 9: World Vision Indonesia’s Emergency Response to the West Sumatera Earthquake	56
Annex 10: The Stories	59
Annex 11: Other recommendations	64
Annex 12: References	66