

Management Response to Recommendations in Final Evaluation

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
Specific objective 1: Increased production and marketing of livestock and livestock products		
<p>In terms of designing of the project, the Evaluation Team (ET) has observed that there was mismatch between life of the project and the time required to effectively implement some of the activities. There was need only to integrate risk reduction measures into project activities, and not for implementation of CMDRR among the consortium members. Future similar need identification and planning exercises should make sure that there is compatibility between the life of the project and the time required to fully accomplish the project activities, and whether there is practical need and interest to implement the identified project activities.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>CAFOD/SCIAF/Trócaire in Ethiopia (CST) and implementing partners will consider in any future proposal development.</p>
<p>The overall objective of the BRPC was that pastoralist communities in Borana Zone develop increased productive and income generating capacity which reduces their vulnerability to volatile food prices. Accordingly, the project had planned and worked on improvement of the long-term food security status of the target pastoralist communities and to eventually reduce their vulnerability to volatile food prices, not on immediate and direct food prices reduction. However, the severe drought that, among the others, claimed lives of more than 300,000 livestock, had made the effort in vain and also unattainable for the immediate years to come. There is ongoing need for relief intervention in the area and immediate need for recovery from the drought, for example supporting the restocking of productive and reproductive assets for the most affected communities.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>The CST programme approach in Borana Zone endeavours to protect livelihoods interventions by linking development and humanitarian programmes. During the severe drought period in 2011, CST led two interagency multi-sector needs assessments and in response to the findings implemented a number of relief projects in target woredas with partners that were also part of this consortium. The purpose of the interventions was to save lives and protect livelihoods. CST and partners are now planning to implement a large-scale recovery intervention in the same woredas, providing support for restocking and rangeland management. CST and partners are also implementing a Comic Relief funded intervention in the same woredas, focusing on livelihoods diversification and market access to build resilience to future shocks. It is recognised that building resilience requires long term engagement and CST has made a commitment to continue programming with partners in Borana. The recommendation is therefore timely and accepted, to ensure future programming links relief, recovery and development. There was an effort for linking emergency relief with rehabilitation and long term development works in some woreda like Teltela, Dire and Miyo but it is not</p>

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
		sufficient. These recommendations are well taken for intentionally link emergency response and rehabilitation in all projects coming.
It had been planned to increase income from livestock and livestock by-products by 30%; and to enable 50% of the livestock related IGA beneficiaries access new markets. However, in spite of promising starts by some cooperatives and individuals, and though the rangeland and the water related interventions were expected to contribute to this ambitious target, principally related to the severe drought, the targets were not met. On the contrary, it appears that the drought has considerably retarded livelihoods of the people.	Accepted	During planning it is good to have manageable targets considering the effect of drought on expected results. However, the CST programme approach in Borana Zone endeavours to protect livelihoods interventions by linking development and humanitarian programmes. As described above, humanitarian interventions were implemented in order to save lives and also to protect assets and livelihoods being supported through development programming. The overall goal of the project is building resilience, which is a long term process. Targets set during the planning phase were ambitious, but real achievements have been seen as described in the narrative report and the final evaluation report.
As it is an important problem of the community, there is need for further promotion and support of rangeland bush clearing and rehabilitation of degraded grazing lands	Accepted	The recommendation will be included in future programme planning. Selective bush clearing and rehabilitation of degraded rangelands are activities included in the 18-month recovery project submitted to the EC Instrument for Stability.
As it could lead to intensification and transformation of the rangeland management through time, promote and support the development and use of the <i>kalo</i> system for small groups of villages/HHs	Accepted	The recommendation will be included in future programme planning.
Synchronized effort should be made to institutionalize bush clearing as part of the regular activity of the community	Accepted	The recommendation will be included in future programme planning. Monitoring visits to implementation sites already show that some of the target communities are undertaking selective bush clearing independently of project support, having received training and hand tools from the project. Activities will be consolidated in future projects, including the project submitted to the EC Instrument for Stability.
Future range land improvement interventions should consider a more integrated approach that include biological and physical soil and water conservation measures; reseeded and enriching the grass/forage plants; fencing/enclosing, water point development, termite control and promotion of cut-and-carry system.	Accepted	The integrated approach was already adopted by one of the partners in the consortium, and the plan is to implement this approach more widely in future programming. The project put forward for EC Instrument for Stability funding includes the integrated approach as part of its natural resource management methodology.

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
There is need for initiation and supporting participatory research for identification of more effective and compatible bush clearing techniques for the different tree species.	Accepted	During the last quarter of the project the consortium carried out a research study on Rangeland Degradation in Borana, Ethiopia: Causes, Consequences and Options for Improvement.
Though it seems to deserve further assessment, there were suggestions to conduct prescribed and controlled burning of rangelands	Accepted	The proposal put forward for the EC Instrument for Stability includes a planned assessment on options for prescribed and controlled burning for Borana rangeland while developing a field guide for selective bush clearing.
It is recommendable that future similar interventions should work on the problem of termite infestation which is a growing threat in the area on rangelands and on the emerging crop husbandry	Accepted	A pilot termite management activity has been included in the proposal submitted to the EC Instrument for Stability.
As need for more quantity was reported by different informants of the ET, future similar interventions should consider provision of hand tools required for bush clearing.	Accepted	This recommendation will be taken forward in future planning. The project put forward for the EC Instrument for Stability includes budget for sufficient hand tools to complete the planned work.
In order to ensure sustainability of the bush clearing practice and its broader adoption and institutionalization in Borana and enhance contribution to the further development of the technique, the rich who are the principal users of the rangeland should be involved in the practice in one way or the other.	Accepted	The arrangement agreed by the consortium during project implementation was a target of 20% free labour contribution to rangeland rehabilitation works. The thinking behind this target was to include the more well-off community members who own livestock and would therefore directly benefit from the improved rangeland resource. The poorer and more vulnerable community members would participate through cash-for-work programming. The drought meant that this target was only reached by one implementing partner, but the target has been carried forward into the EC Instrument for Stability project design. The idea will be discussed with community and local government officials on how we can involve rich pastoralist
It is needless to recommend for continued water development intervention in the area. Nevertheless, the interventions should consider improving the existing traditional water points and developing new wisely managed water points at strategic sites, and work towards maintaining sustainable balance between water availability and herd size.	Accepted	Water, being one of the key problems facing pastoralist communities, will be a priority in future intervention. Provision of water for livestock and potable water for human consumption are included in the EC Instrument for Stability proposal.
All water interventions should ensure adequate involvement of the traditional water management structure and should also work in line with the traditional water	Accepted	Water interventions will be implemented with full involvement of traditional water structure. Community structures responsible for the maintenance and management of the water sources will be

Evaluation Recommendations		Acceptance	Management Response
	management system.		strengthened in future interventions, adding to the sustainability of the water sources. Some water schemes, such as those with pump technology, have user fee arrangements put in place to ensure maintenance and repairs can be done, ensuring the financial sustainability of the schemes. Traditional schemes, such as ponds and <i>ellas</i> , are managed within the existing traditional structures which have been found to be effective and sustainable. The traditional structures in Borana are responsible for holistic governance and management of natural resources on which the pastoral livelihoods depend. It is therefore important to manage water resources through these existing traditional structures, recognizing that water and rangeland resources are inter-related and the way one is managed affects the availability and quality of the other.
	Lobby the Gumi Gayo for inclusion of women in the water management structure like what was done for sending girls to school.	Accepted	Similar interventions will be implemented with continuous lobby and dialogue with Gumi Gayo.
	In order to maximize impact of the water related interventions, there is need for continued work on water sanitation and hygiene altogether. There is also need for teaching on effective use of water purification chemicals. Application of the WASH approach would be more effective if the government Health Extension Workers were involved.	Accepted	Water sanitation and hygiene will be considered in all future water works together with all possible ways to increase potable water coverage. The planned EC Instrument for Stability project includes the construction of slow sand filters to provide potable water from ponds, and will hold experience sharing forum around provision of potable water in the pastoralist context in Borana.
	Renovation and completion of the damaged Kasso rock water harvesting structure is highly recommended at least due to economic and social reasons. There is also clear need for improving design of the structure including those discussed under Section 2.2.2. Delayed renovations might result in more costs.	Accepted	CST, together with AFD the implementing partner, is seeking funds from different sources to complete the remaining work and to hand over to the community to serve its ultimate use.
	Silt traps could increase life and usability of ponds through reducing siltation. They could also improve purity of the water. Therefore, it is advisable to include this structure as part of pond rehabilitation and building.	Accepted	This idea is well noted and has already been considered in the design of the water component of the EC Instrument for Stability proposal.
	There is possibility to further improve Ella Dhoqola in Dire District by constructing a canal that collect water from the	Accepted	If the idea is technical feasible, it will be considered by implementing partners working in Dire: ACORD

Evaluation Recommendations		Acceptance	Management Response
	cluster of <i>ellas</i> situated in the hill down to the bottom the hill where it is more convenient for watering animals		
	Promote and encourage the people to put aside adequate amount of reserve money for the case of malfunctioning of water points, especially for purchase of industrial materials.	Accepted	Some water schemes have user fee arrangements put in place to ensure maintenance and repairs can be done, ensuring the financial sustainability of the schemes. Ensuring financial sustainability of all water schemes will be considered in all future works by the consortium.
	In order to ensure their sustainability and realization of their impacts, most of the activities accomplished under this outcome deserve follow up. Some of the interventions intended to capacitate the newly established or the already existing coops were not completed by the time of visit of the ET and seemed to require some time.	Accepted	The same idea was reflected in the value chain and cooperative research report which was conducted in the first year of the project and CST proactively prepared a proposal and secured three years funding from Comic Relief to fill the gap and ensure strong and sustainable cooperatives.
	It appears that all of the livestock related coops deserve continued capacity building interventions like training for their leaders, staff and members; and technical (like bookkeeping) and regulatory (like auditing) supports.	Accepted	As above.
	Even though they could not equally compete with the individual traders, livestock related coops can serve at least to regulate prices by serving the pastoralists as alternative market channels in case of lower prices under normal conditions. However, some of the livestock related coops were observed competing with their members. In general, coops should not be encouraged to get involved in communal production.	Accepted	With exception of encouraging good experience replication by individual coops member from the existing coops we will avoid any unnecessary competition among cooperatives and their members.
Specific objective 2: Asset-poor community members are empowered to diversify their livelihoods and generate increased income			
	Cooperatives should not be involved in common production activities, but should provide marketing services for individual production of their members and members of the community. In the case of indivisible production units like soap production, the members should be paid based on quantity and quality of their individual or group production.	Accepted	
	It is advisable to check whether interest and target of the cooperative members is the objective they report (solving their common problem like lack of access to fair market in	Accepted	Will be checked in all future support. The Comic Relief project has been designed to assess cooperatives' status and performance against a number of factors and indicators, with the intention to support those

	Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
	common) or the seed money and the other supports provided by projects.		that have the interest and capacity to engage effectively in business activities. A range of financial and technical support will be targeted at selected cooperatives that meet the agreed criteria.
	Promoting crop farming could, among the others, provide the people with food and the livestock with feed; and also diversify food, feed and income sources of the people both in kind and temporally. It appears to be a time for this because the people have learned use of crop by-products for feed and also considered crop husbandry as an enterprise. Future interventions should consider this in partnership with the local research centre.	Not accepted	Even though agro-pastoralists exist in Borana Zone and use their crop residue as cattle feed, it is not our plan to encourage more crop production. Rather, our strategy is towards sustaining pastoralist livelihoods and building resilience.
	In Borana usually, milk is available for a maximum of four months. This puts under question profitability of the milk marketing coops. On the other hand, it indicates the need to consider other possible activities in addition to the milk marketing, which is already considered in some cases.	Accepted	This recommendation will be considered in future planning.
	For existence of sustainable pastoralism, a balance between pasture, water, livestock and fair input-out market is needed. It appears that this balance would no more be a case and possible due to internal and external factors. Given this fact, there is practical and increasing need for promotion and support of non-livestock sources of livelihood in the area in order to diversify livelihood of the people who can no longer survive as pure pastoralists.	Accepted	Will be considered in future project planning and implementation. The Comic Relief project being implemented in five of the target woredas in Borana Zone is focusing entirely on this issue. The project has been designed in response to the learning and recommendations from this project, and the interventions will scale up SACCOs and support existing natural resource producer groups for livelihoods diversification, income generation opportunities, access to credit, access to markets and support to move up the value chain.
	SACCOs are more successful and seem to coincide with interest and need of members of the community who can no more live as pastoralists. Especially, they have proved instrumental for addressing the poor women. However, some of them were established only after the mid-term review of this project. All of them are constrained by lack of working capital. In general, SACCOs deserve adequate follow up and financial, technical and material support so that they continue serving their members effectively.	Accepted	Follow up and necessary support will be considered in future planning and implementation. The new Comic Relief project is responding to the research study conducted with support of this project, that recommended supporting SACCOs as they are sustainable and the most effective way of economically empowering women. One of the main outcome areas of the planned project is to increase the number of SACCOS, increase membership, providing training and basic education for members, and supporting capable members in engaging in small business activities.
	Absence of micro financing institutions operating in the rural Borana justifies the need for channeling adequate	Accepted	Will be considered in future implementation

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
working capital for the existing and newly emerging SACCOs to the extent that volume of the money does not affect the local market/local economy		
The MTR had recommended for ‘strengthening of the coops to the level of union formation’. Even though we also believe that SACCOs should come together through unions, preceding experiences teach that formation of coop unions should be preceded by producing and existence of strong, sustainable and self standing primary coops that can effectively utilize the union. Once they are proved to be reasonably strong, it is recommendable to bring the SACCOs together under union, which among the others, could help improve their access to working capital.	Accepted	We have a clear plan to transform SACCOs and primary cooperatives to Union.
The government cooperative promotion offices lack budget and technical capacity to provide the technical and regulatory support required by the cooperatives. In addition to these, high and frequent staff turnover and lack of interest and motivation from the side of the experts are the other challenges. These indicate the need for continued work on building capacity of leaders and members of the coop as a long run solution, and to retain the bookkeepers for the coops (in group when circumstances so allow) for considerable time.	Accepted	The project has already identified capacity gaps, particularly around logistics, of government offices including the Cooperative Promotion Office. The consortium has provided appropriate support and will continue to do so through the Comic Relief project. Capacity building will be considered in all future projects
Most of the coops hold a huge amount of money at hand. Absence of bank in the vicinity was reported as a reason. As the risk of total loss of the money is costly than depositing in the nearby bank (Yabello or Moyale) the coops should be encouraged to learn using banks.	Accepted	All cooperatives will be encouraged to use banks for any financial transactions. This will be included in the training and experience sharing opportunities given to cooperatives through the new Comic Relief project.
Auditing accounts of the coops would enhance transparency and cultivate mutual trust among the members. Therefore, future interventions should lobby for and support regular auditing of accounts of the coops.	Accepted	Annual audit of cooperatives will be encouraged by all partners. The new Comic Relief project has set aside budget for honorarium for cooperative book keepers and for cooperatives’ annual audit fees.
In some cases, members of the coops are made to pay income tax from the dividend they get from profit of the coop even when they decide to capitalize their share of the	Accepted	Will be checked with the existing commercial code.

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
<p>dividend. Perhaps, this does not seem to be in line with provision of the commercial code in this regard. The concerned government offices and also NGOs working with coops should check this.</p>		
<p>Some of members of the consortium had organized groups running saving and credit activities in a modality different from SACCO that does not seem to be based on any supporting legal framework. It is advisable to organize such groups within the context of the existing legal framework in a way that would ensure legality, sustainability and acceptance from the concerned government offices.</p>	Accepted	IGAs of ACORD will be organized in the context of the existing legal framework; If IGAs are not recognized as legal entity.
<p>Some of the SACCOs were observed charging interest rate which is higher than what is provided in their bylaws. Even though it seems that this was done to improve financial capacity of the coops, this situation, among the others, might discourage the members. This deserves follow up and technical support of the government CPOs.</p>	Accepted	Correction will be made on those cooperatives charging interest rate higher than their by-laws and continuous monitoring will continue for consistency.
<p>Specific objective 3: Local institutions, traditional leaders and local government are effectively governing and managing pastoralist food security and livelihoods</p>		
<p>Even though the first indicator was not met, meetings sponsored and facilitated by the project were held at kebele, district and zone levels almost as planned though participation of local authorities and leaders of customary institutions was not as good as expected. In addition to the fact that the intended objective was not met, it seems that the meetings will not continue after the project.</p>	Accepted	Various meetings were facilitated which improved the understanding at kebele, district and zone level by making key pastoral issue the centre of discussions on rangeland rehabilitation, water development, people settlement and other issues. The number and frequency of meetings started to decline during the drought period.
<p>Such final outcome of this project in relation the value chain approach and observations from other similar preceding interventions hint existence of needs for contextually re-examining the concept and applicability of value chain approach and its usability. Working on building capacity of cooperatives (unions and primaries) to enable them look for and get linked to potential and alternative markets and building their capacity in this regard, and to open them to markets by working on accessibilities seem</p>	Accepted with remark	This was done properly with field accompaniment and different efforts towards market links. However, there continues to be a need to strengthen and implement the value chain study recommendations gathered through this project in the new Comic Relief project.

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
more feasible and fruitful, hence advisable.		
<p>It appears that huge resources (for relief, rehabilitation, project based development, regular government development program, PSNP, etc) have been channeled to the pastoralist Borana with attempt to improve livelihoods of the people. However, situations have been growing worse than better over time. This has happened due to factors that include the following that resulted in inefficient utilization of the available resource: absence of coordination and integration; existence of duplication of efforts; failure to build on preceding achievements and experiences; absence of interest for networking and information exchange; concentrating on small works rather than pulling resources and work on intervention that could entail basic change; etc.</p>	Accepted	<p>.All our new projects are designed in such a way that fully consider the learning and recommendation from previous projects, including any learning from other partners and study recommendations. The Building Resilient Pastoralist Communities project was informed by learning from the Pastoralist Food Security Partnership Project and the research on cooperatives and value chain, conducted in this project, guided the design of the new Comic Relief project. Working in consortium, we have good track record of coordination, integration and information exchange. Borana is frequently affected by drought and all our projects in the Zone, throughout the continuum of emergency, rehabilitation and long term development, are geared towards building the resilience of pastoralist communities and we will continue doing this in a more integrated ways.</p>
<p>This situation indicates the need for developing synergy for optimum and more effective utilization of the available resources and entails practical and continuing improvement on life of the people and their lasting resilience. Perhaps donors funding projects implemented in the area could play important role in this regard. As to observations, since EU and USAID are the bigger donors funding intervention in Borana, they can put in place this desirable improvement. Possibly, EC can also take the initiation.</p>	Accepted	<p>We will improve the coordination at zone level and CST can take the initiative with budget planning for venue, refreshment and proceeding development.</p>
<p>Synchronized approach could enable to finance bigger programs that could work on basic problems of the people and result in fundamental and sustainable changes in their life. SORDU, which was wrongly terminated, could be type intervention that should be envisaged.</p>	Accepted	
<p>Discussion with the Yabello Research Centre has revealed that there are on shelf technologies in the areas of crop and livestock husbandry, rangeland management, agricultural processing, and moisture management that could be introduced to the people in the target area. Future</p>	Accepted	<p>After checking the available and tested technologies in Yabello Research Centre against the needs of the community, we will consider in the future project planning.</p>

Evaluation Recommendations	Acceptance	Management Response
<p>intervention could consider dissemination of these technologies. Specifically, NGOs should also work on promotion of husbandry of pertinent corps in partnership with the research centre with a bid to diversify livelihood of the people and increase their chance for resiliency.</p>		
<p>For non-cost extension, It appears that the principal reason is ambitious planning that fail to limit itself by considering the prevailing circumstances and challenges. It also seems that NGOs are forced to fit into predetermined project duration regardless of the actual time required to fully accomplish the activities they identify based on assessment of local needs. Are some cases, good proportion of the planned time elapses for non-project activities like waiting for signing project agreements? Etc. It seems that this situation deserves further investigation and subsequent corrective measures by all parties (EC, the co-financers and the implementing partners).</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>This feedback was given to the EU during a reflection meeting and also through a formal survey facilitated by CONCORD. In all future proposal development the allowed time frame will be considered carefully in planning.</p>