

**Executive Board Second Regular Session** 

Rome, 12-14 November 2012

# EVALUATION REPORTS

Agenda item 6

For consideration



Distribution: GENERAL WFP/EB.2/2012/6-C/Add.1

28 September 2012 ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

#### MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY EVALUATION REPORT – SOMALIA COUNTRY PORTFOLIO

This document is printed in a limited number of copies. Executive Board documents are available on WFP's Website (http://executiveboard.wfp.org).

#### NOTE TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

#### This document is submitted to the Executive Board for consideration

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, RMP\* Mr C. Kaye tel.:066513-2197

Senior Programme Adviser, Mr P. Rodrigues tel.:066513-2361

OD\*\*

Programme Adviser, RMP Ms K. Oppusunggu Tel.: 066513-3068

Should you have any questions regarding availability of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact Ms I. Carpitella, Senior Administrative Assistant, Conference Servicing Unit (tel.: 066513-2645).



<sup>\*</sup> Performance and Accountability Management Division

<sup>\*\*</sup> Operations Department

#### **BACKGROUND**

1. This document presents the management response to the recommendations of the Somalia country portfolio evaluation (2006–2011). The evaluation does not cover the response to the Somalia famine declared on 20 July 2011.

- 2. The Secretariat appreciates the findings and recommendations, which have informed the preparation of the new Somalia protracted relief and recovery operation (PRRO). As WFP shifts from emergency assistance towards longer-term, targeted programmes, it seeks to develop capacities of communities, partners and local governments and enhance the ability of vulnerable households to withstand recurrent shocks.
- 3. Many of the recommendations have been implemented. The country office will continue to refine its capacity development and partnerships as recommended.
- 4. The Secretariat's responses to the recommendations are presented in the attached matrix.



Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
Recommendation 1: The vulnerability analysis and mapping (VAM) Unit in the Somalia country office should be strengthened to provide food and nutrition security information that complements the assessments and analysis undertaken by the Food Security and Nutrition Analysis Unit-Somalia (FSNAU), the Famine Early Warning Systems Network (FEWS NET) and other contributors. The information should mainly support WFP's capacity to make relevant and decisive strategic programme decisions, but should also contribute to improving the knowledge of both state actors and other humanitarian partners in planning	Country office	Agreed.  For several years the country office has been working to strengthen VAM. It conducted food security and vulnerability assessments for the regions covered by WFP area offices in Somaliland in October 2008; in Puntland in April 2007; in Galkayo in January 2011; in Mogadishu in August 2011; and in border areas in April 2012. WFP and the FSNAU also carried out joint assessments in Mogadishu in December 2011, April 2012 and July 2012. The VAM assessments in Mogadishu and border areas included a focus on nutrition. In 2011/12 several rapid assessments on food security and nutrition were conducted, inclusive of clan-related issues.	Ongoing
and responding effectively. Specifically:		After the evaluation period a second international VAM officer joined the unit, focusing on assessments.  A market analyst post was advertised internally and then externally, but no qualified candidate was found. The post is to be re-advertised if funding allows.	Implemented  December 2012
1a) Carry out independent studies with technical support from the regional bureau and Headquarters, to determine: i) the benefits that households of different compositions, wealth groups and livelihood zones derive from food assistance; ii) the impacts of food assistance on local agricultural and pastoralist economies, including the effect on labour markets within Somalia; and iii) the situation of the urban poor, as opposed to traditional internally displaced persons (IDP) communities, with particular reference to gender and clan affiliation, to inform WFP's future targeting strategy. (by mid-	Country office in collaboration with the Regional Bureau Nairobi (East and Central Africa – ODN) and the Food Security Analysis Service (ODXF)	Partially agreed.  Under PRRO 200443, evaluations and impact studies – some internal and some external – will be conducted on: education activities (2012); the blanket supplementary feeding programme (seasonally beginning in 2013); targeted supplementary feeding family rations (2014); coping capacities (2014); and the mother-and-child nutrition activity (2015). Regular market analysis, a Somalia pastoral study (2013) and additional rapid assessments will be conducted as needed.  Clan affiliation has recently been included as one aspect of assessments.	2012–2015 Implemented
2013)		The country office does not agree fully with the recommendations concerning different economies.  Together with local food security experts it monitors variables such as market prices, terms of trade and labour rates that could be affected by humanitarian responses. This allows the	Implemented



Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
		country office to adjust its programming to minimize undesirable impacts; existing analyses are sufficient to monitor the potential impact of assistance. In addition, Version 2 of the Integrated Food Security Phase Classification (IPC) system – used by the FSNAU and other partners for seasonal assessments – incorporates humanitarian assistance and its impact as a factor for classifying the food security situation.  Full functioning of IPC Version 2 will allow deeper understanding of the effects of humanitarian assistance on local economies.	Mid-2013 (depending on the FSNAU)
1b) Improve the collection and analysis of data on food market economics in Somalia with technical support from the regional bureau and Headquarters, focusing on markets' capacity to respond to changes in demand through market-based responses, such as cash and vouchers, and the implications of cross-border trade flows on household access to essential food commodities, in collaboration with FEWS NET and FSNAU. (by end 2013)	Country office in collaboration with ODN/ODXF	Agreed.  Price analysis tools are being reviewed and improved in the context of emergency operation (EMOP) 200281. The regional bureau, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and FEWS NET are tracking cross-border trade flows; data will continue to be collected if funding and regional capacities are available.  WFP conducted market assessments to inform the use of vouchers under EMOP 200281 and uses assessments to review the cost-effectiveness and efficiency of different transfer modalities and to determine how well markets function.  As with recommendation 1a), the full roll-out of IPC Version 2 will provide better information on markets.	End 2013 Implemented



Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
Recommendation 2: WFP should base the country strategy – developed within the framework of the overarching United Nations Somalia Assistance Strategy (UNSAS) – on area-level strategies that take into account: i) the different political and security contexts of each area; ii) the diversity of livelihood zones; iii) the different emphases across the relief-development continuum, including contingency planning, emergency preparedness and response, recovery and transition; iv) alternative transfer modalities for food assistance – food-based, voucher based and cash-based – that can be applied in different rural and urban situations; and v) the variable capacities of state authorities, institutions and humanitarian partners. Specifically:	Country office, in collaboration with ODN/the Programme Division (ODX)/ the Performance and Accountability Management Division (RMP)	Agreed.  EMOP 200281 was based on analysis conducted with local authorities through a series of area-level strategy development sessions in February 2011 to determine the relevant policies, strategies and objectives of each authority. Analysis at the area office level was also conducted to determine the underlying causes of food insecurity in different livelihood zones and understand local capacities and social/political contexts.	Implemented
2a) Where feasible, WFP area-level strategies should concentrate more on addressing the underlying causes of malnutrition through collaboration with principal partners – FAO, the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) – that offer different and complementary expertise and competencies, thus ensuring: i) a concerted approach to building household and community resilience to shocks in the most vulnerable areas of Somalia; ii) better programming synergies and more effective use of resources, such as by integrating food for assets (FFA) into broader agricultural and pastoral development projects, and integrating targeted supplementary feeding (TSF) into the Outpatient Therapeutic Programme (OTP); and iii) prioritizing interventions such as school feeding in areas of higher food and nutrition insecurity where coverage is low. (by end 2013)	Country office in collaboration with partners and ODN/ODX	Each year in February reviews are conducted with government/local authorities, other United Nations agencies and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in each area to identify synergies; seasonal response analysis and internal reviews are also conducted. In August 2012, greater attention was paid to transfer modalities in the seasonal response analysis.  For the development of PRRO 200443, a trend analysis of the food and nutrition security was conducted that took into account political and security contexts, livelihood zones and shocks. It was discussed with FAO, Somalia Water and Land Information Management (SWALIM), FSNAU and FEWS NET and informed decision-making on the appropriate types of responses for different areas.  In March to May 2012, a joint strategy for enhancing resilience was developed with FAO and UNICEF. An operational plan was developed in July to August 2012 and presented to donors.	Implemented Implemented Implemented

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
		WFP conducted an evaluation of its school feeding programme, which included household surveys that the country office will review, along with education school feeding indicators, to determine potential hand-over strategies over the course of 2013, possibly phasing out some schools. While the country office is shifting to a PRRO – and recognizing that school feeding is WFP's priority in highly food-insecure areas – it is important to continue to do rigorous food security assessments. However, these trend analyses are a contribution to better understanding food security contexts for programme design, and as an entry point for partner discussions and consensus-building.	Implemented February 2013
Recommendation 3: There should be a paradigm shift within WFP, increasing the emphasis on and incentives for measuring results. Information and analysis generated by the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Unit should be more than a compliance tool; it should more effectively inform and support WFP programming by providing first-hand information on the relevance and impacts of different interventions on different socio-economic groups, and should rely less on relatively weak secondary data. Specifically:	Country office in collaboration with RMP/ODX	Agreed.  This shift is already well under way. As pointed out in the evaluation report, the M&E Unit and systems in the country office have undergone several changes during the evaluation period. The compliance-oriented systems were enhanced from late 2010 to 2012, and processes have been put in place to ensure the M&E system informs programming effectively.  The country office does not agree with the evaluation's general conclusion that secondary data is "weak", but does agree that this data should be improved and supplemented by primary data to the extent possible. Under the PRRO, WFP will continue to work with ministries and partners in education, health and other sectors to strengthen national capacities in assessments, implementation and reporting as an integral part of the activities in the EMOP 200281 and PRRO 200443 (see Recommendation 4). WFP and partners will continue to focus on national authorities' capacities to report on outcome-level data.	Ongoing



Reco	ommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
3a)	Realistic and measurable outcome indicators should be developed with technical support from the regional bureau and Headquarters. The indicators should be directly attributable to different WFP programme interventions – especially innovative approaches such as TSF – incorporated into the M&E system and reported in Standardized Project Reports (SPRs) in addition to output data. (for incorporation into the SPR 2013)	RMP	Partially agreed. The country office uses the corporate Strategic Results Framework, which includes output and outcome indicators, and agrees that outcome reporting against realistic indicators needs to be improved. For the development of PRRO 200443 and EMOP 200281, the M&E and VAM units are reviewing the collection of outcome indicators such as the food consumption score, and are exploring how to perform more regular data collection and improve analysis with a view to providing better information on the country office's impact. This is currently being done with an evaluation of the school feeding programme, using monitoring data, household surveys and data on schools. WFP is implementing a targeted outcome measurement and reporting strategy on selected projects using additional corporate M&E analysis, support and guidance, and reviewing assessments and systems to improve indicator reporting against the Strategic Results Framework. Somalia operations benefit from corporate-wide activities designed to improve outcome reporting on food security, nutrition, education, resilience-building and capacity development.	December 2014  December 2012
3b)	An outreach strategy must be developed that articulates how issues and concerns raised by beneficiaries and their communities, through field monitoring, will be taken into account and inform programme planning and design. (by mid-2013)	Country office in collaboration with government authorities/United Nations system/NGOs/civil society and ODN/ODX/RMP	Agreed.  The country office has developed systems to identify and address beneficiary concerns through monitoring systems and a hotline for beneficiaries and communities to communicate directly to the country office. While technological issues have limited the effectiveness of the hotline, the country office will ensure beneficiaries are better informed about channels of communication, and if technically feasible will provide local contact numbers.	Mid-2013

Reco	ommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline	
skills more autho asse WFP to otl	commendation 4: WFP must have the requisite s and resources for enhanced field monitoring and effective capacity development of state porities and cooperating partners in supporting systems and implementing and reporting on programme interventions, with close reference ther capacity development efforts of the ed Nations system. Specifically:	Country office/ODN/ ODX/RMP	Agreed. The country office has worked with line ministries in Somaliland and Puntland to expand the ministries' role in assessments, implementation and reporting on health, nutrition and education activities. It coordinates with UNICEF and others to develop the capacity of the health ministries. The country office has led facilitation of the development of a national nutritional strategy with the involvement of UNICEF, World Health Organization (WHO) and the Intergovernmental Authority on Development.	Implemented	
4a)	WFP should develop area offices' capacity to generate and analyse output and outcome information within their zones, supported by more trained field monitors with better understanding of the nutrition and food security objectives incorporated in WFP programming. (by mid-2013)	Country office/ODX/ RMP	Agreed.  In the context of EMOP 200281 food aid monitors are trained to analyse food security information and programme activities. The PRRO 200443 budget provides for additional national officers to work on nutrition and livelihoods, school feeding, cash/vouchers, M&E, VAM and other areas.  WFP as a whole is committed to developing staff capacity and technical expertise in the areas of market analysis and nutrition, especially in challenging situations.	Implemented and ongoing	
4b)	WFP should support capacity development objectives in the area-level strategies more effectively, focusing on the requisite capacity of government institutions mandated to fulfil emergency preparedness and disaster risk management – such as the National Environment Research and Disaster Preparedness and Management Authority in Somaliland and the Humanitarian Affairs and Disaster Management Agency in Puntland – and on planning departments in the education and health sectors. Capacity development should allow government offices to assume increased responsibility for information collection, monitoring and technical support to training, school feeding and nutrition interventions. (by end-2013)	Country office in collaboration with government authorities and ODN/the Emergencies Division (ODE)/ODX	Agreed.  Support for capacity development of the National Environment Research and Disaster Preparedness and Management Authority (NERAD) and the Humanitarian Affairs and Disaster Management Agency (HADMA) has been incorporated into PRRO 200443. WFP offices in Somaliland and Puntland are increasingly involving both entities in WFP-led assessments and both participated in recent response analyses.  Since 2010, as part of a joint strategy with UNICEF, WFP has provided capacity development assistance to education and health authorities in Somaliland and Puntland. Capacity development of school feeding units focuses on monitoring and ensuring objectives are achieved.	Ongoing Ongoing	



## wfp.org

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline	
<b>Recommendation 5:</b> WFP must considerably improve its external consultations on and communication of analysis, programme planning and decision-making to ensure better transparency and greater accountability to its principal stakeholders. Specifically:		Partially agreed. WFP agrees that improvements in communication can still be made, but regrets that this recommendation fails to take into full account significant steps taken by the country office to improve consultations with partners. These include:	Implemented and ongoing	
Sa) WFP should build on recent initiatives in liaisir regularly with donors and cooperating partners at the country and area office levels respectively, by defining a communications are partnership strategy that identifies activities through which partners are regularly informed of programme developments and related issues, with technical support from the regions bureau and Headquarters. (by mid-2013)	technical support from ODN/the Communications, Public Policy and Private Partnership Division	<ul> <li>strategy development and review sessions with local authorities, United Nations agencies and NGOs (see Recommendations 2 and 2a) above);</li> <li>quarterly cooperating-partner meetings;</li> <li>regular meetings with the education and health ministries in Somaliland and Puntland;</li> <li>monthly donor meetings;</li> <li>development of the joint FAO–WFP–UNICEF strategy for enhancing resilience including consultation among the three agencies and with the United Nations country team, donors and clusters;</li> <li>involvement of other agencies, organizations and authorities in WFP-led assessments;</li> <li>post-assessment briefings for technical stakeholders at Area office level and in Nairobi;</li> <li>community consultations contributing to the development of PRRO 200443 (May 2012); and</li> <li>consultations with donors and United Nations agencies on the development of PRRO 200443 (May 2012).</li> <li>WFP is committed to continued dialogue with partners to ensure the effectiveness and efficiency of its programmes.</li> </ul>	Mid-2013	

<u> </u>	SOMALIA COUNTRY PORTFOLIO				
Rec	ommendations	Action by Mana	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline	
established food security at the field level, WFP sh consideration of a range response options based on nutrition security analysis FSNAU, FEWS NET and roles that WFP, FAO and play in these responses; implementation plans, promption of the many strategies in the event the	As co-lead – with FAO – of the newly established food security cluster in Nairobi and at the field level, WFP should: i) facilitate consideration of a range of short- to long-term response options based on the food and nutrition security analysis available from FSNAU, FEWS NET and WFP; ii) define the roles that WFP, FAO and other partners can play in these responses; iii) share analysis, implementation plans, progress reports and M&E related to its food assistance programme with other principal actors; and iv) use the cluster as a forum for advocacy on alternative strategies in the event that a principal actor such as WFP cannot gain access to specific areas. (by mid-2013)	WFP and FAO country offices in collaboration with partners and food security cluster members	Agreed.  In February 2012, the former food assistance cluster and the former agriculture and livelihoods cluster merged to form the food security cluster (FSC), which adapted its members' advisory and reporting roles to the modalities of current programmes. The 2012 Consolidated Appeal Process (CAP) document reported that FSC member activities included improving access to food, investing in livelihoods, supporting safety-net programmes and providing access to cash, food, vouchers, livestock vaccinations, seeds, tools, fertilizer and others. The FSC seasonal and multi-year activities allow for assessment beyond the immediate and seasonal requirements of populations in crisis: FSC members can share strategies for enhancing resilience capacity in stressed communities.  The joint FAO-UNICEF-WFP resilience strategy and the NGO consortium resiliency strategy suggest that the FSC will work with its members through 2013 to reassess approaches to building resilience. Analysis undertaken by FEWS NET, FSNAU and WFP's VAM unit are shared with the FSC membership to enhance understanding of the IPC and how to prioritize responses, including contingency planning and	Implemented	
			preparedness. In the new three-year CAP the FSC will facilitate discussion on response options and strategies. It will also review coverage of regions to ensure food security activity coverage in spite of access constraints.  WFP increasingly incorporates discussion of transfer modalities in its seasonal response analysis, which includes external partners. The FAO-UNICEF-WFP strategy will		
			complement this collaboration through coordination on transfer modalities.  WFP has scaled up its planned cash and voucher interventions under EMOP 200281 and has planned a continuation under PRRO 200443, although implementation levels will depend on funding availability. The operations include interventions designed to address short-term requirements along with recovery and resilience-building activities.	Implemented	



#### ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

CAP Consolidated Appeal Process

EMOP emergency operation

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

FEWS NET Famine Early Warning Systems Network

FSC food security cluster

FSNAU Food Security and Nutrition Analysis Unit – Somalia

IDP internally displaced person

IFAD International Fund for Agricultural Development

IPC Integrated Food Security Phase Classification

M&E monitoring and evaluation

NGO non-governmental organization

ODN Regional Bureau Nairobi (East and Central Africa)

ODX Programme Division

ODXF Food Security Analysis Service

PRRO protracted relief and recovery operation

SPR Standardized Project Report

TSF targeted supplementary feeding
UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

VAM vulnerability analysis and mapping

